



PAN
Localization

www.pan10n.net

Mainstreaming Gender in PAN Localization Project 2007 – 2010

Regional Team



www.cle.org.pk

Center for Language Engineering (CLE)
Al-Khwarizimi Institute of Computer Science (KICS)
University of Engineering & Technology (UET)

Introduction

- ❑ “Gender is a social construct that defines roles, behaviour, activities and attributes associated with being male and female” (United Nations, 1995)
- ❑ Gender perspective mostly remained neglected in the development projects till late 20th century
- ❑ Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) strongly are strongly emphasizing gender equality within each of the focus area
- ❑ As a consequence, development projects are strongly focusing to ensure gender equality within the program designs and execution

Introduction

- ❑ As a consequence, development projects are strongly focusing to ensure gender equality within the program designs and execution
- ❑ Although gender analysis has become an accepted part of most development interventions, it is still a rarity in ICT for development projects.
- ❑ Gender analysis of ICT projects involves the application of general principles of gender analysis as well as gender considerations specific to ICTs

Evaluation Objectives

- ❑ Evaluation objectives in assessing Gender Mainstreaming
 - ❑ The contribution of each country partner institute in mainstreaming gender perspective in the project
 - ❑ Gender mainstreaming efforts of country components specifically in technology localization, localized content development and end-user training on localized software
 - ❑ The project phases where gender is least integrated

Evaluation Framework for Gender Mainstreaming

- ❑ Development of Gender Mainstreaming Evaluation Framework for local language computing projects involved reviewing
- ❑ Gender Evaluation Methods for Internet and ICTs
- ❑ Adaptation of United Nation's gender mainstreaming approach
- ❑ Adaptation of [World Bank's check list of Planning, Design and Implementation of an ICT Project Incorporating Gender Issues](#)

Gender Mainstreaming Evaluation Framework (GMEF)

- ❑ A pioneering framework in mainstreaming gender and its appraisal in localization project
- ❑ Addressed the following areas
 - ❑ Project Designing
 - ❑ Project Preparation
 - ❑ Project Implementation
 - ❑ Project Monitoring
 - ❑ Project Evaluation
 - ❑ Project Management

GMEF

- ❑ Mainstreaming in Project Design
 - ❑ Inclusion of gender objectives in Project Objectives
 - ❑ Incorporation of women in setting gender objectives
 - ❑ Identification of gender and ICT issues
 - ❑ Inclusion of measures for the assurance of gender equality in target population

GMEF

- ❑ Mainstreaming in Project Preparation
 - ❑ Addition of gender expert in the project team
 - ❑ Gender awareness among the project staff

- ❑ Mainstreaming in Project Implementation
 - ❑ Development of gender based strategies to raise women participation

 - ❑ Assurance of equality in access and usage of ICT resources

 - ❑ Collaboration to ensure gender equality in the project

GMEF

- ❑ Mainstreaming in Project Implementation
 - ❑ Consultation with stakeholders to understand gender and ICT issues
 - ❑ Reporting of gender based issues in the project

- ❑ Mainstreaming in Project Monitoring
 - ❑ Adaptation of gender sensitive M&E framework
 - ❑ Collection of gender disaggregated data
 - ❑ Separate performance indicators for both genders

GMEF

- ❑ Mainstreaming in Project Evaluation
 - ❑ Gender analysis in the TORs of the evaluation team
 - ❑ Gender equality in evaluation team
 - ❑ Incorporation of separate analysis for both gender

GMEF

- ❑ Mainstreaming in Project Management
 - ❑ Gender equality in project team
 - ❑ Integration of specific strategies to ensure gender equality in project team
 - ❑ Gender equality in opportunities for professional development
 - ❑ Allocation of budget for the implementation of gender based strategies

Methodology

- ❑ Development of the structured questionnaire on above explained parameters of GMEF
- ❑ Quantification of responses through lickert scale
- ❑ Data analysis
- ❑ Country wise and phase wise assessment of gender mainstreaming in PAN Localization project

Overall Findings of Gender Mainstreaming

Phase	MN	PLC	ENRD	MPP	D.NET	BT	PK
Design	3	2	4	2	4	4	4
Preparation	X	5	5	5	5	5	5
Implementation	3	4	4	4	4	3	4
Monitoring	3	5	5	5	5	5	5
Evaluation	3	3	3	3	3	4	4
Project Management	4	3	3	2	4	5	4
Overall	3	3	4	3	4	4	4

Gender Mainstreaming: Project Designing

Phase	MN	PLC	ENRD	MPP	D.NET	BT	PK
Design	3	2	4	2	4	4	4

The CPIs who achieved "high level or 4 on 1-5 Likert scale" during project designing phase focused on:

1. Inclusion of gender perspective in identifying vision and objectives

"Dareecha", CLE, Pakistan

"Vision: Localized software are reducing the intensity of technophobia especially among females, so they are no more self excluded from ICT and is thereby decreasing socio-cultural barriers. By utilizing localized software, they are not only becoming a part of networked world"

Gender Mainstreaming: Project Designing (Cont.)

2. Identification of gender and ICTs issues

- ❑ *Bangladesh, Pakistan* identified gender and ICT issues related to the end-user training during project designing phase

3. Strategies to increase women participation

- ❑ *Bangladesh:*
 - ❑ *Project team reduces the qualification level of participants so that more women can apply for the training*
 - ❑ *Project team also did advocacy with the local organization so that they send a female participation for the training*

Gender Mainstreaming: Project Designing (Cont.)

Strategies to increase women participation

□ *Pakistan*

- *formation of gender balanced project team in the context of local norms, the female trainers conducted the training in girls' schools and the male trainers conducted the training in boys' schools in parallel*
- *Use of positive words to avoid the negative stigmas attached to them e.g. instead of chatting the project use the word of instant messaging*

Gender Mainstreaming: Project Designing (Cont.)

4. Gender balanced target population

- By using gendered outcome mapping framework, the project identified equal number of male and female boundary partners and also their associated progress markers. The boundary partners included female students, male students, female teachers and male teachers.
- *Selected equal number of boys and girls schools for the training*

Gender Mainstreaming: Project Designing

- ❑ The CPIs who achieved only "satisfactory level " or less during project designing phase:
 - ❑ The project vision and mission statements developed through the gendered outcome mapping framework lacked explicit gender focus.
 - ❑ No specific strategies were developed to ensure gender balance target population prior to the project as the team had reported that "***the technology is gender neutral.***"
 - ❑ Gender imbalanced teams during setting objectives.

Gender Mainstreaming: Project Preparation

Phase	MN	PLC	ENRD	MPP	D.NET	BT	PK
Preparation	X	0	5	5	5	5	5

- Liaison with the **regional evaluation consultant** "Ms.Sana Shams on gender issues
- GEM Thematic Adaptation Workshop** for Localization Initiatives, Jan 17-19, 2009 Vientiane, Lao PDR
Bangladesh, Bhutan, Cambodia, Laos, Nepal and Mongolia
- Mentoring** : Angela Marianne Kuga Thas, Association for Progressive Communication (APC)
- Session was conducted on Gender Methods during "PAN Localization Project Phase II Meeting" January 24th - 27th, 2007, Thimphu, Bhutan

Gender Mainstreaming: Project Implementation

Phase	MN	PLC	ENRD	MPP	D.NET	BT	PK
Implementation	3	4	4	4	4	3	4

- Pakistan, Nepal, Bangladesh implemented specific **strategies** to include and increase the participation of women as
 - Included and trained mother and women groups
 - formation of gender balanced project team in the context of local norms
 - Mobile Lady

- Nepal
 - Project team specifically focused on **different applications** in giving training to the different groups.
 - Students : Writer, presentation, and e-mail/internet skills
 - Teacher: Spread sheet and presentation, e-mail/internet.
 - Women: Writer and spread sheet.

Gender Mainstreaming: Project Implementation (Cont.)

❑ Equitable access to project ICT resources

- ❑ Hard printed training kits developed in local language
Nepali trainees stated, *"It is easy to understand"* and *"It is easy to carry to their home for the study even (when) they are outside of computers."*
- ❑ Bangladesh: "local language is understandable to all specifically for women"

Gender Mainstreaming: Project Implementation (Cont.)

- ❑ Consultation regarding gender issues are held with key stakeholders
- ❑ Partnership built to enhance outreach and improve access to resources by women
 - ❑ PLC, Cambodia: project team engaged the *ministry of interior and the govt. officials in the national assembly*, the key stake holders' of the technology
 - ❑ DIT, Bhutan: Collaboration with Sherubtse college to enhance outreach and access of the project resources for both men and women
 - ❑ CLE, Pakistan: Partnership with Govt. Official (DCO etc.) to improve women participation in end users training

Gender Mainstreaming: Project Monitoring

Phase	MN	PLC	ENRD	MPP	D.NET	BT	PK
Monitoring	3	5	5	5	5	5	5

- Gender Sensitive Framework
 - Gendered Outcome Mapping Framework
- Separated Performance Indicators
- Collected sex-disaggregated data

Gender Mainstreaming: Project Evaluation

Phase	MN	PLC	ENRD	MPP	D.NET	BT	PK
Evaluation	3	3	1	4	2	4	4

- Gender Analysis in TORs
- Gender balanced evaluation team
- Analyzed gender segregated data
- Include a section on gender focus in project reports

Gender Mainstreaming: Project Management

Phase	MN	PLC	ENRD	MPP	D.NET	BT	PK
Project Management	4	3	3	2	4	5	4

- Gender balanced project team
 - End-users training team
 - Technology development team
 - Content development team

Gender Mainstreaming: ENRD, Nepal

- Level of gender mainstreaming in E-Network Research and Development (ENRD), Nepal

Project Phase	Ranking	
Project Design	3	Satisfactory
Project Preparation	5	Very High
Project Implementation	4	High
Monitoring	5	Very High
Evaluation	2	Low
Project Management	3	Satisfactory
Overall Gender Mainstreaming	4	High

Gender Mainstreaming: ENRD, Nepal (Cont.)

- ❑ Special attention has been paid in highlighting gender perspective. The project vision developed through gendered outcome mapping framework had explicit focus on gender
- ❑ In setting these objectives, women have equally participated.
- ❑ *It was also noted that "the women in target population were not much literate".* For making project more effective for women, gender and ICTs related issues were identified.

Gender Mainstreaming: ENRD, Nepal

- ❑ Mother's group as one of the important boundary partner of the project for the localized ICT training program.
- ❑ As reported, the primary reason behind selecting this group was, *"As mother's group is one of the active community based group running and managed by local people, (thus) PAN Localization training project could (effectively) capitalize (upon) their local network"*.

Gender Mainstreaming: ENRD, Nepal (Cont.)

In addition the project team had consulted the gender expert and based on her recommendation, as reported the project team was able to identify

- ❑ Gender issues related (to the) training need of team member,
- ❑ Gender issues related to (project) activities that need to be incorporated in the core programs,
- ❑ Awareness programs related with gender need to be organized at the local level and
- ❑ Gender issues related (to) content need to disseminate among the trainees and villagers via telecenter.”

Gender Mainstreaming: ENRD, Nepal (Cont.)

- ❑ Trainees were also provided hard printed training kits developed in Nepali, because as reported by the project team, *"It is easy to understand"* and *"It is easy to carry to their home for the study even (when) they are outside of computers."*
- ❑ For women team focused on writer and spread sheet training based on their needs and interest.

Gender Mainstreaming: ENRD, Nepal (Cont.)

- ❑ The project adopted gendered outcome mapping framework and had developed gender specific performance indicators by developing different progress markers for the separately identified male and female boundary partners.
- ❑ Based on the development of separate performance indicators for male and female boundary partners, sex-disaggregated data was also collected for project monitoring.

Gender Mainstreaming: ENRD, Nepal (Cont.)

- ❑ Gender perspective was adopted in the later stage of the project.
- ❑ Evaluation team also ensured gender equality in its project team.

Gender Mainstreaming: ENRD, Nepal (Cont.)

- ❑ Total 3 women out of 10 were part of team delivering end-user training. Within the team, only Ms. Ambika Timila was heading the finance department.
- ❑ Professional development opportunities were provided to women as well through through the regional conferences and training organized by the PAN Localization project's regional secretariat.

Gender Mainstreaming: D.Net, Bangladesh

- Level of gender mainstreaming in Development Research Network (D.Net), Bangladesh Project

Project Phase	Ranking
Project Design Included gender equality objectives, a	4 High
Project Preparation	5 Very High
Project Implementation	4 High
Monitoring	5 Very High
Evaluation	2 Low
Project Management	4 High
Overall Gender Mainstreaming	4 High

Gender Mainstreaming: D.Net, Bangladesh (Cont.)

Mobile Infomedary helping the villager for asking livelihood queries to the Help Desk



Gender Mainstreaming: D.Net, Bangladesh

- ❑ Project vision and mission statements developed through the gendered outcome mapping framework
- ❑ Gender focus is reflected in the identification of male and female boundary partners (Male Infomediary, Female Infomediary, Male Content End-Users, Female Content End-Users, Female Print-Disabled and Male Print-Disabled)

Gender Mainstreaming: D.Net, Bangladesh (Cont.)

- ❑ Project team reduces the qualification level of participants so that more women can apply for the training
- ❑ Project team also did advocacy with the local organization so that they send a female participation for the training
- ❑ The training of infomediaries and content developer included a specific session on gender issues
- ❑ Hard printed training kits developed in Bangla, because as reported by the project team, “local language is understandable to all specifically for women” and findings showed that more women accessed local content

Gender Mainstreaming: DIT, Bhutan

- Level of gender mainstreaming in Department of Information and Technology (DIT), Bhutan Project

Project Phase	Ranking	
Project Design	4	High
Project Preparation	5	Very high
Project Implementation	4	High
Monitoring	5	Very high
Evaluation	4	High
Project Management	5	Very high
Overall Gender Mainstreaming	4	High

Gender Mainstreaming: DIT, Bhutan

- ❑ Incorporated gender perspective in project's vision and mission developed through Gender Outcome Mapping
 - ❑ Mission stated, "The program will ensure the equal participation of both genders"
- ❑ Involved women in developing project objectives

Gender Mainstreaming: DIT, Bhutan (Cont.)

- ❑ Identification of gender and ICT issues
 - ❑ High illiteracy level of women in the developing countries;
 - ❑ Problems of availability and affordability of software and user support for women was limited;
 - ❑ fewer numbers of women in the formal sector (civil service, private agencies etc

Gender Mainstreaming: DIT, Bhutan (Cont.)

- ❑ Ensuring gender equality in target population through reduction in the price of training fee being charged and requested to get equal number of nominations of women and men for the training
- ❑ In project preparation, women were given more opportunity to take part in the training
- ❑ If the no. of male applicants exceeded the no. of women applicants (which was always the case), all the female applicants included in the training

Gender Mainstreaming: DIT, Bhutan (Cont.)

- ❑ To enhance gender awareness, two members of the project team had received gender based trainings before the project initiation
- ❑ In end-users training , the ratio of women was more than the men in the field of Education and Health
- ❑ Collaboration with Sherubtse college to enhance outreach and access of the project resources for both men and women